



HUMAN TRAFFICKING  
LAW AND POLICY



Bridgette Carr  
Anne Milgram  
Kathleen Kim  
Stephen Warnath

 LexisNexis

# HUMAN TRAFFICKING LAW AND POLICY

---

**Bridgette Carr**

*Clinical Professor of Law  
Director Human Trafficking Clinic  
University of Michigan Law School*

**Anne Milgram**

*Senior Fellow and Adjunct Professor  
NYU School of Law*

**Kathleen Kim**

*Professor of Law  
Loyola Law School Los Angeles*

**Stephen Warnath**

*Chief Executive Officer, The Warnath Group, LLC  
Founder and President, NEXUS Institute*

# Table of Contents

<b>Chapter 1</b>	<b>SLAVERY</b> .....	<b>1</b>
I.	INTRODUCTION .....	1
II.	SLAVERY IN THE COLONIES AND THE EARLY REPUBLIC .....	1
III.	<i>DRED SCOTT</i> AND THE CITIZENSHIP QUESTION .....	3
	<i>Scott v. Sandford</i> .....	4
	Notes and Questions .....	10
IV.	THE CIVIL WAR AND THE EMANCIPATION PROCLAMATION ...	11
	The Emancipation Proclamation .....	13
V.	THE THIRTEENTH AMENDMENT: ABOLITION OF SLAVERY ...	15
	U.S. Constitutional Amendment XIII (1865) .....	16
VI.	THE THIRTEENTH AMENDMENT AND <i>AH SOU</i> .....	17
	<i>United States v. Ah Sou</i> .....	18
	Notes and Questions .....	20
VII.	CONCLUSION .....	20
<b>Chapter 2</b>	<b>PEONAGE</b> .....	<b>21</b>
I.	OVERVIEW: FROM PROCLAMATION TO PEONAGE .....	21
II.	PEONAGE IN THE SOUTHWEST .....	22
	<i>Jaramillo v. Romero</i> .....	22
	Notes and Questions .....	25
III.	PEONAGE IN THE AMERICAN SOUTH .....	26
A.	The Peonage System .....	27
B.	An Example .....	27
IV.	CHALLENGING THE PEONAGE SYSTEM: FINDING AND ENFORCING FEDERAL LAW .....	28
A.	Anti-Peonage Act of 1867 .....	28
B.	The First Court Test — <i>US v. Clyatt</i> .....	29
	<i>Clyatt v. United States</i> .....	29
	Notes and Questions .....	31
V.	<i>BAILLEY</i> AND <i>REYNOLDS</i> : TWO ADDITIONAL CHALLENGES TO PEONAGE .....	33
A.	The <i>Bailey</i> Case .....	33
	<i>Bailey v. Alabama</i> .....	33
	Notes and Questions .....	38
B.	The <i>Reynolds</i> Case .....	38
	<i>United States v. Reynolds</i> .....	39
	Notes and Questions .....	41
VI.	CONCLUSION .....	41

---

*Table of Contents*

<b>Chapter 3</b>	<b>INVOLUNTARY SERVITUDE</b> .....	<b>43</b>
I.	INTRODUCTION .....	43
	<i>United States v. Ingalls</i> .....	43
	Notes and Questions .....	46
II.	THE INVOLUNTARY SERVITUDE STATUTE .....	47
III.	INTERPRETING 18 U.S.C. § 1584: THE CIRCUIT COURT SPLIT ....	48
	<i>United States v. Shackney</i> .....	48
	Notes and Questions .....	59
	<i>U.S. v. Mussry</i> .....	60
	Notes and Questions .....	66
	<i>United States v. Kozminski</i> .....	67
	Notes and Questions .....	85
	<b>Appendix to Chapter 3</b> .....	<b>90</b>
<b>Chapter 4</b>	<b>IMMIGRATION STATUTES AND THE MANN ACT</b> ...	<b>95</b>
I.	IMMIGRATION STATUTES .....	95
	Notes and Questions .....	96
II.	THE MANN ACT .....	97
A.	Legislative History .....	97
B.	The Mann Act as Passed in 1910 .....	98
C.	Constitutionality of the Mann Act .....	99
	<i>Hoke v. United States</i> .....	100
	Notes and Questions .....	102
D.	Scope of the Mann Act .....	103
	<i>Caminetti v. United States</i> .....	104
	Notes and Questions .....	106
E.	Decline of the Mann Act .....	106
F.	Victim’s Perspective .....	107
III.	MODERN-DAY MANN ACT .....	108
<b>Chapter 5</b>	<b>TVPA: THE TRAFFICKING VICTIMS PROTECTION ACT</b> .....	<b>109</b>
I.	POLICY HISTORY .....	109
A.	El Monte .....	110
B.	From El Monte to a Multi-Pronged Approach .....	111
II.	THE LEGISLATIVE HISTORY OF THE TRAFFICKING VICTIMS PROTECTION ACT .....	112
A.	Criminal Provisions .....	113
1.	Forced Labor .....	113

---

## Table of Contents

	<i>United States v. Kaufman</i> . . . . .	115
	Notes and Questions . . . . .	120
2.	Sex Trafficking . . . . .	120
	Notes and Questions . . . . .	122
3.	Trafficking, Document Servitude, and Attempt . . . . .	122
	Notes and Questions . . . . .	124
B.	Restitution and Civil Relief . . . . .	127
C.	Social Service Provisions . . . . .	128
<b>Chapter 6</b>	<b>THE PALERMO PROTOCOL</b> . . . . .	<b>129</b>
I.	INTRODUCTION . . . . .	129
II.	ANATOMY OF A DEFINITION . . . . .	130
A.	Overview . . . . .	130
B.	Dissecting the Three Elements . . . . .	131
1.	<i>The “Recruitment, Transportation, Transfer, Harboring or Receipt of Persons”</i> . . . . .	132
2.	<i>“By Means of the Threat or Use of Force or Other Forms of Coercion, of Abduction, of Fraud, of Deception, of the Abuse of Power or of a Position of Vulnerability or of the Giving or Receiving of Payments or Benefits to Achieve the Consent of a Person Having Control Over Another Person”</i> . . . . .	133
3.	<i>“for the Purpose of Exploitation”</i> . . . . .	134
	Notes and Questions . . . . .	135
III.	AN UMBRELLA TERM . . . . .	135
	Notes and Questions . . . . .	136
IV.	SPECIAL DEFINITIONAL ISSUES . . . . .	137
A.	Human Trafficking Under the Guise of Adoption . . . . .	137
	Notes and Questions . . . . .	137
B.	“Fostering” and “Children in Domesticity” . . . . .	138
	Notes and Questions . . . . .	138
C.	Child Brides and Forced Marriage . . . . .	138
	Notes and Questions . . . . .	139
D.	Labor Migration . . . . .	139
	Notes and Questions . . . . .	139
E.	Exploitation of the Prostitution of Others . . . . .	139
	Notes and Questions . . . . .	140
F.	Removal of Organs . . . . .	140
G.	Consent . . . . .	140
	Notes and Questions . . . . .	140
V.	EXTENDING THE SCOPE OF CRIMINAL LIABILITY . . . . .	141
	Notes and Questions . . . . .	142

---

*Table of Contents*

VI.	OBLIGATION BY COUNTRIES TO CRIMINALIZE . . . . .	142
	Notes and Questions . . . . .	143
VII.	EIGHT PRINCIPLES OF GOOD ANTI-TRAFFICKING LEGISLATION . . . . .	144
1.	Prioritize Victim-Centered Responses . . . . .	145
2.	Link Provision of Victim Care and Protection to Need in Individual Cases . . . . .	146
3.	Address All Forms of Human Trafficking and Protect/Assist All Categories of Victims . . . . .	146
4.	Implement a Comprehensive and Integrated Response . . . . .	147
5.	Address Root Causes/Contributing Factors . . . . .	147
6.	Act in the Best Interest of the Child . . . . .	148
7.	Maximize Cooperation, both International and Domestic . . . . .	148
8.	Provide Meaningful Legal Remedies: Ensure Access to Justice for Victims; Establish Deterrent, Proportionate, and Effective Penalties for Traffickers; and Dismantle Criminal Enterprises . . . . .	149
	Notes and Questions . . . . .	149
<b>Chapter 7</b>		
	<b>AN INTERNATIONAL LEGAL AND POLICY FRAMEWORK . . . . .</b>	<b>151</b>
I.	PREVENTION . . . . .	152
	Notes and Questions . . . . .	153
II.	PROTECTION & ASSISTANCE . . . . .	153
A.	Protecting Physical Safety . . . . .	154
	Article 24 Protection of witnesses . . . . .	154
	Notes and Questions . . . . .	155
B.	Assistance . . . . .	155
	Article 6 Assistance and protection of victims of trafficking in persons . . . . .	156
	Article 25 Assistance to and protection of victims . . . . .	156
	Notes and Questions . . . . .	156
III.	PROSECUTION . . . . .	158
	Notes and Questions . . . . .	159
IV.	SHORTCOMINGS OF THE PROTOCOL . . . . .	160
V.	EVOLVING LAW AND POLICY SINCE THE PROTOCOL: STRENGTHENING THE PROTOCOL'S PROTECTIONS AND ASSISTANCE . . . . .	162
	Notes and Questions . . . . .	164
VI.	LOOKING FORWARD: INTERNATIONAL COURTS AND THE ANTI- TRAFFICKING OBLIGATIONS OF NATIONS . . . . .	164
	<i>Rantsev v. Cyprus and Russia</i> . . . . .	165
	Notes and Questions . . . . .	178

---

## *Table of Contents*

<b>Chapter 8</b>	<b>CORPORATE ACCOUNTABILITY AND FEDERAL CONTRACTORS</b> .....	<b>181</b>
I.	LEGAL LIABILITY FOR COMPANIES .....	182
	Article 10 Liability of legal persons .....	182
II.	COUNCIL OF EUROPE CONVENTION ON ACTION AGAINST TRAFFICKING IN HUMAN BEINGS .....	183
	Article 22 Corporate liability .....	183
	Article 25 Azerbaijan The Law on the Fight Against Trafficking in Persons, 2005 Liability of legal entities for trafficking in persons . . . .	183
	Antigua and Barbuda The Trafficking in Persons (Prevention) Act, 2010 .....	184
	Notes and Questions .....	184
III.	SPECIAL SUB-GROUP OF CORPORATE ACCOUNTABILITY: FEDERAL CONTRACTORS .....	185
	Kathryn Bolkovac, DynCorp, and Human Trafficking in Bosnia Herzegovina .....	186
	Section 3271. Criminal offenses committed by Federal contractors outside the United States .....	188
IV.	FEDERAL ACQUISITIONS REGULATIONS .....	189
	Notes and Questions .....	191
	Notes and Questions .....	192
	Executive Order 13627: “Strengthening Protections Against Trafficking in Persons in Federal Contracts” & the Ending Trafficking in Government Contracting Act .....	192
	Notes and Questions .....	194
	Title XVII — Ending Trafficking in Government Contracting .....	194
V.	DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE .....	197
	Notes and Questions .....	201
VI.	SPECIAL CASE: THE ROLE OF LABOR RECRUITERS IN HUMAN TRAFFICKING .....	201
	Optimal Regulatory Approach for Labor Recruiting .....	202
	Notes and Questions .....	202
VII.	TRANSPARENCY LAWS .....	203
	California Transparency in Supply Chains Act .....	203
	Notes and Questions .....	205
	Business Transparency in Trafficking and Slavery Act .....	206
	Notes and Questions .....	206
	A Practical Example: Transparency and Conflict Minerals .....	207
	Notes and Questions .....	208
VIII.	CODES OF CONDUCT AND GUIDING PRINCIPLES .....	208
	Notes and Questions .....	209

---

*Table of Contents*

<b>Chapter 9</b>	<b>ANTI-TRAFFICKING AGENCIES AND ORGANIZATIONS</b>	<b>211</b>
I.	INTRODUCTION	211
II.	THE U.S. GOVERNMENT	211
A.	The President	211
B.	The Department of Justice	212
1.	DOJ Criminal Prosecutions	212
a.	DOJ Sections: The Criminal Section and the Child Exploitation Section	213
i.	The Criminal Section	213
ii.	Child Exploitation Section	213
b.	United States Attorneys' Offices	214
c.	Other Partnerships and Coordinated Prosecution Efforts	214
C.	Federal Law Enforcement and Anti-Trafficking Task Forces	215
1.	The FBI	215
a.	Child Sex Tourism Initiative	215
b.	Innocence Lost Initiative	215
2.	Anti-Trafficking Task Forces	216
3.	DOJ Annual Report to Congress	216
D.	The Department of State	216
1.	The Trafficking in Persons Report	217
2.	Foreign Financial Assistance Grants	219
3.	Public Engagement and Awareness	219
4.	Additional State Department Offices and Efforts	219
E.	The Department of Homeland Security	219
F.	The Department of Health and Human Services	220
1.	Certification for Foreign Victims of Trafficking	220
2.	HHS Services Grants	221
3.	Public-Awareness and Victim-Identification Efforts	221
G.	The Department of Labor	221
H.	Other Federal Agencies	222
III.	NON-GOVERNMENTAL ORGANIZATIONS	223
IV.	INTERNATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS	223
A.	The United Nations	223
1.	United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime	224
2.	International Labor Organization	224
B.	Non-United Nations Organizations	224
1.	International Organization for Migration	224
2.	Council of Europe	224
3.	Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe	225
V.	CONCLUSION	225



---

## Table of Contents

<b>Chapter 10</b>	<b>FEDERAL CRIMINAL PROSECUTIONS</b>	<b>227</b>
I.	INTRODUCTION	227
A.	Criminal Prosecutions Under the TVPA	227
1.	Forced Labor	227
2.	Sex Trafficking	228
3.	Other Offenses	228
B.	Evolution of Criminal Prosecutions	228
II.	BASIC PRINCIPLES FOR CRIMINAL OFFENSES UNDER THE TVPA	229
III.	FORCED LABOR	230
A.	Pre-TVPA Forced Labor Cases	231
1.	<i>United States v. Harris</i>	231
2.	The Paoletti Case	231
3.	<i>United States v. Kozminski</i>	232
B.	Post-TVPA Forced Labor Cases	233
1.	<i>United States v. Bradley</i>	233
	<i>United States v. Bradley</i>	233
	Notes and Questions	239
2.	Additional Cases That Define and Expand § 1589	240
a.	Non-economic Labor or Services	240
b.	Abuse of the Legal Process as a Form of Coercion	241
c.	Peonage	242
d.	Forced Labor Involving Compelled Sexualized Labor	244
e.	Forced Labor by Military Contractors	245
C.	Domestic Servitude	247
1.	<i>United States v. Calimlim</i>	247
	<i>United States v. Calimlim</i>	247
2.	Involuntary Servitude and Domestic Servitude	251
3.	Domestic Servitude and Sexual Abuse	252
4.	Additional Issues: Document Servitude, the Knowledge Requirement Under Forced Labor, and Restitution	253
5.	Domestic Servitude and Diplomatic Immunity	254
IV.	SEX TRAFFICKING	256
A.	International Sex Trafficking	256
1.	Mexican Sex Trafficking Rings	257
	Kate Brumback & Mark Stevenson, <i>Mexican Women Forced into U.S. Prostitution by Pimps</i>	257
2.	An Example: <i>United States v. Jimenez-Calderon</i>	261
	<i>United States v. Jimenez-Calderon</i>	261
B.	Domestic Sex-Trafficking	263
1.	An Example: <i>United States v. Pipkins</i>	263

---

## Table of Contents

	<i>United States v. Pipkins</i> . . . . .	263
2.	Other Issues: Conspiracy, the Definition of Commercial Sex Act, and Interstate Commerce . . . . .	265
3.	Reasonable Opportunity to Observe . . . . .	267
4.	Exclusion of Victims' Prior Sexual Behavior . . . . .	268
C.	Other Examples of Sex Trafficking in the United States . . . . .	269
D.	The PROTECT Act of 2003 and the Constitutionality of § 2423(c) . . . . .	271
V.	CONCLUSION . . . . .	272
<hr/>		
<b>Chapter 11</b>	<b>CIVIL LITIGATION</b> . . . . .	<b>273</b>
<hr/>		
I.	INTRODUCTION . . . . .	273
	Kathleen Kim & Kusia Hreshchyshyn, <i>Human Trafficking Private Right of Action: Civil Rights for Trafficked Persons in the United States</i> . . . . .	274
	Notes and Questions . . . . .	278
II.	18 U.S.C. § 1595: THE TRAFFICKING PRIVATE RIGHT OF ACTION . . . . .	279
	<i>Rosa Romero Hernandez, Plaintiff v. Samad Attisha; and Yvonne Attisha, Defendants</i> . . . . .	279
	Notes and Questions . . . . .	284
III.	SCOPE OF DEFENDANTS UNDER § 1595 . . . . .	285
	<i>John Roe I v. Bridgestone Corp.</i> . . . . .	286
	Notes and Questions . . . . .	294
IV.	IMMIGRATION RELIEF UNDER § 1595 . . . . .	294
	<i>Garcia v. Audubon Cmty. Mgmt., LLC</i> . . . . .	295
	Notes and Questions . . . . .	298
V.	STATE TRAFFICKING CIVIL REMEDIES . . . . .	300
VI.	THE ALIEN TORT CLAIMS ACT ("ATCA") . . . . .	301
	Notes and Questions . . . . .	306
VII.	FEDERAL RACKETEER INFLUENCED AND CORRUPT ORGANIZATIONS ACT ("RICO") . . . . .	307
	Notes and Questions . . . . .	312
VIII.	FAIR LABOR STANDARDS ACT ("FLSA") . . . . .	313
A.	Wage and Hour Protections . . . . .	313
B.	Employment Relationship . . . . .	315
	Notes and Questions . . . . .	318
IX.	ADDITIONAL CAUSES OF ACTION . . . . .	320
A.	Discrimination Claims . . . . .	320
1.	Title VII of the Civil Rights Act ("Title VII") . . . . .	320
2.	42 U.S.C. § 1981 . . . . .	320
3.	Conspiracy to Interfere with Civil Rights ("Section 1985") . . . . .	321
B.	Torts and Contracts Claims . . . . .	321

---

*Table of Contents*

Notes and Questions . . . . . 322

---

**Chapter 12 IMMIGRATION RELATED PROTECTIONS FOR VICTIMS OF TRAFFICKING . . . . . 323**

---

I. T VISA REQUIREMENTS . . . . . 323

A. How to Apply for a T Visa . . . . . 324

B. Interpreting and Applying the T Visa Requirements . . . . . 326

1. Interpreting Criteria One: Victim of a “Severe Form” of Human Trafficking . . . . . 326

2. Interpreting Criteria Two: Physical Presence . . . . . 328

3. Interpreting Criteria Three: Compliance with Law Enforcement . . . . . 329

4. Interpreting Criteria Four: Extreme Hardship Involving Severe and Unusual Harm . . . . . 331

5. An Additional Consideration: Admissibility . . . . . 332

II. DERIVATIVE VISAS . . . . . 332

III. CAPS ON T VISA AND DERIVATIVE VISAS . . . . . 333

Notes and Questions . . . . . 333

IV. CHALLENGES TO OBTAINING A T VISA . . . . . 333

A. Lack of Access to Legal Services . . . . . 338

B. Definitional Barriers . . . . . 339

1. Are You a “Victim” if You Escape? . . . . . 339

2. Can an Individual Agree to be a Slave? . . . . . 339

3. Does Human Trafficking Require Transportation? . . . . . 340

V. BENEFITS FOR TRAFFICKING VICTIMS AND DERIVATIVES . . . . . 340

VI. OTHER FORMS OF IMMIGRATION RELIEF . . . . . 342

A. U Visa . . . . . 342

B. Asylum . . . . . 344

C. Violence Against Women Act . . . . . 346

D. Special Immigrant Juvenile Status . . . . . 349

E. S Visa . . . . . 350

Notes and Questions . . . . . 352

---

**Chapter 13 THEORETICAL AND DEFINITIONAL CHALLENGES . . . . . 353**

---

I. SEX TRAFFICKING AND PROSTITUTION . . . . . 353

Catharine A. MacKinnon, *Trafficking, Prostitution, and Inequality* . . . . . 354

Ann Jordan, *Sex Trafficking: The Abolitionist Fallacy* . . . . . 359

Notes and Questions . . . . . 362

*DKT International, Inc., v. United States Agency for International Development* . . . . . 365

Notes and Questions . . . . . 368

---

*Table of Contents*

II. LABOR-FOCUSED APPROACHES . . . . . 369  
    Melynda Barnhart, *Sex and Slavery: An Analysis of Three Models of  
    State Human Trafficking Legislation* . . . . . 370  
    Notes and Questions . . . . . 372  
    Notes and Questions . . . . . 373  
III. CONSENT vs. COERCION . . . . . 374  
    Kathleen Kim, *The Coercion of Trafficked Workers* . . . . . 376  
    Notes and Questions . . . . . 379  
IV. CONCLUSION . . . . . 379

---

**Chapter 14           SPECIAL ISSUES RELATED TO SPECIFIC  
                          TRAFFICKED POPULATIONS . . . . . 381**

---

I. IMMIGRATION ENFORCEMENT AND UNDOCUMENTED  
WORKERS . . . . . 381  
    A. Undocumented Workers . . . . . 381  
    B. Immigration Reform and Control Act . . . . . 383  
        Notes and Questions . . . . . 385  
        Notes and Questions . . . . . 387  
II. VICTIMS OF SEX TRAFFICKING . . . . . 390  
    Notes and Questions . . . . . 391  
    A. Reconciling State Laws on Sex Trafficking and Prostitution . . . . . 392  
        *In Re B.W.* . . . . . 392  
        Notes and Questions . . . . . 399  
III. DOMESTIC WORKERS . . . . . 400  
    *United States v. Djoumessi* . . . . . 401  
    Notes and Questions . . . . . 405  
IV. AGRICULTURAL WORKERS . . . . . 405  
    Notes and Questions . . . . . 407

---

**APPENDIX 1        STATE AND LOCAL HUMAN TRAFFICKING LAWS  
                          AND PROSECUTIONS . . . . . 409**

---

**APPENDIX 2        18 USCS § 1589 . . . . . 439**

---

**TABLE OF CASES . . . . . TC-1**

---

**INDEX . . . . . I-1**

---