A Perfect Mix? Methods and Models for Mixing Services for Victims of Domestic Violence and Trafficking in Persons in Europe & Eurasia

December 4, 2008

Rebecca Surtees and Susan Somach

Creative Associates International, Inc., the Aguirre Division of JBS International, Inc. and the NEXUS Institute to Combat Human Trafficking
Methods and Models for Mixing Services for Victims of DV and TIP

• Research Framework
• Methodology and Limitations
• Experiences and Impact of TIP and DV
• Different Models of Service Provision
• Different Forms of Assistance
• Mixed Services and Mixed Populations: Key Issues and Considerations
• Conclusions and Recommendations
Research Framework

Lines of Inquiry

• Similarities between TIP and DV experiences
• Differences in assistance needs of victims
• Services and assistance models for different victims
• Capacity and willingness of services providers to assist mixed populations, and implications
• Stigmatization and discrimination experienced by victims
• Circumstances for effective and appropriate mixed services
• Implications for USAID policy of combining (or separating) assistance programming for TIP and DV victims

Existing Knowledge and Gaps
Methodology

Timeframe:
June to September 2008

Techniques

• Interviews with professionals working in DV and TIP assistance and protection programs in E&E
• Interviews with victims of trafficking and domestic violence
• Literature review and secondary sources
Countries: Albania, Armenia, Azerbaijan, Bosnia & Herzegovina, Bulgaria, Kyrgyzstan, Georgia, Moldova, Serbia, Russia, Ukraine

Organizations Consulted by Types of Services:
• *TIP victims only*: 9 professionals from 7 organizations
• *DV victims only*: 17 professionals from 12 organizations
• *TIP & DV victims*: 41 professionals from 24 organizations

Geographic Distribution (same numbers as above):
• *SEE*: 25 professionals from 16 organizations
• *FSU*: 39 professionals from 24 organizations

Interviews with victims – 17 in total
• 6 TIP only, 5 DV only, 6 both DV & TIP
Limitations

• Limited timeframe – June to September – during summer months
• Language obstacles – finding English speaking staff
• Field travel limited to only two sites
Experiences and Impact of TIP and DV

Differences and Similarities

- Client Characteristics
- Experiences with Violence and/or Exploitation
- Experiences with Exit from Abuse

- Both categories of victims (DV & TIP), while often treated as homogenous because of shared or similar experiences, are extremely diverse.
- Thus, it is important that assistance not be standardized in a way that meets the needs of only one type/profile of victim, rather in a context of a broader range of exploitation and/or abuse.
Models of Service Provision

Residential

- *Communal residential facility*: Dedicated shelter for victims of DV; short-term shelter for foreign TIP victims; shelter for national victims of TIP; semi-independent living facilities for TIP or DV victims; shelter for minor victims of violence; shelter for vulnerable persons

- *Private residential accommodations*: Subsidized apartments; rental vouchers; placement with host families; private, temporary refuge

- *Multi-staged and combined residential accommodations*

Non-residential

- *Centralized service center*

- *Non-centralized services*
Consideration for Mixing Clients within Service Provision Models

- Service provision and need
- Staff capacity to work with both victims of TIP and DV
- Legal and administrative barriers
- Safety and security
- Length of stay and duration of programs
- Appropriate facilities
- Relations between victims of TIP and DV victims
- Stigma and bias
- Mixing minors and adults
Services and Assistance

- Medical Care and Assistance
- Psychological and Psychiatric Assistance
- Legal Assistance
- Educational Assistance and Vocational Training
- Economic Opportunities: Job Placement and Income Generation Activities
- Humanitarian Assistance
- Family Mediation and Counseling Services
- Witness Protection and Security Services
- Specialized Assistance to Minors
Mixing Services and Assistance

Medical

“Right now, the government gives some money for victims of trafficking – for basic medical help. So we have some money for them. But for the victims of domestic violence, unfortunately there is no such help.”

Psychological/Psychiatric

“I preferred not to share my experience. I just didn’t want to bring the memories to my mind. In many cases, women told me their stories, but I usually avoided speaking about traumatic experiences. But I observed that some women wanted to share their experiences – they felt better after this.”
Legal

“In one city with 200,000 population, there is one lawyer who provides consultation in all spheres for a lot of questions. And if there is a trial in the court for the victims of domestic violence or victims of trafficking, of court they need the legal support for that, but it takes a lot of money.”

“For domestic violence, we have a direct procedure and for TIP cases we have to pass through the penal procedures sometimes. So, we have a process for investigation which is completely different. In DV cases, they would need… a civil lawyer. In the case of trafficking, they would need a very strong criminal lawyer.”

“Maybe it would have been more helpful is someone from the center would have joined me at the court hearing every time. Because, when there was somebody from the outside, my husband does not humiliate me, does not threaten me.”
Educational/Vocational

“That’s why we are doing this through [local] NGOs and then when we know what kind of positions are better in the market, we are doing a psychological assessment. We are evaluating the previous background of the victim, the previous education of the victim that she obtained before, and also her skills.”

Economic

“A lot of assistance is provided to the women to help them find jobs and help them keep jobs. They might have three or four jobs before they keep one. Job stability is the key in reintegration.”
Humanitarian

“We try to provide all or at least most of the service needed in such a situation and that is … because here the social support system is not very developed and such cases like DV and TIP here is not guaranteed specific services for them state arranged and dedicated, not by the government.”

Housing

“Usually these [are] women who don’t have an opportunity to stay in another place. They cannot stay in their home because of some dangerous situation. Sometimes their husband doesn’t give the permission to stay.”
Family Mediation/Counseling

“In many cases, the relative also may need counseling in relation to how to give support to daughters, sister, mother, because they may not know or they may feel discouraged themselves because they may have seen her leave the site of violence and go back again, the cycle... In cases of TIP, contact and meetings and mediating process is actually more rare because in such cases the victim herself usually does not want to contact the family.”

Witness Protection/Security

“And who is more dangerous? I think it depends on the situation and circumstances. A perpetrator could be dangerous to a woman his own wife, the same like a trafficker. To me, all of them are dangerous.”
Specialized Assistance to Minors

“And being around adults can be a bad influence on minors and also can influence their decisions because it is easy to influence them. We have some cases where the adults find the solution for themselves but the same solution or decision would be risky for a minor because they can’t manage it. Because minors can be influenced by the other adults in the shelter and they are not able to assess risk.”

“[M]inors must stay longer because they have needs that are longer – like education and finding a long term solution – and when they stay longer with adults their needs and concerns are not captured. But finding alternatives for minors is not easy… Children are better off to get into alternative care, where they can learn about relationships and other life skills.”
Mixed Services and Mixed Populations: Key Issues and Considerations

- Program Objectives and Organizational Approach
- Finances, Facilities, and Resources
- Local Context, Cultural Setting, Legal Framework
- Staff Knowledge, Skills and Attitudes
- Client Profiles, Experiences and Behaviors, and Needs
“My first impression was that services shouldn’t be mixed. However, when I started to think more, answering your questions, differences appeared less and less, and actually I realized that there are many arguments for mixed services.”


“It was hard to set one consistent difference between “real conditions” and how things “could or should be”… At the end, when I was thinking more about real service providers, real people in these organizations and among beneficiaries, again it seemed to me that some obstacles for mixed services will remain important.”
Conclusions

- Mixing services for DV and TIP victims is possible, and at times, advisable.

- However, to mix services *effectively, appropriately, and ethically* requires careful consideration of key issues:
  - Consider the objectives.
  - Assess whether it is cost effective.
  - Ensure cultural and contextual sensitivity.
  - Provide adequate and appropriate training for all staff.
  - Consider your client group.

- And, all service provision should be within a context of *on-going dialogue, monitoring and evaluation.*
Local Scenes
THANK YOU!

Visit www.povertyfrontiers.org/SocialTransitions

for seminar presentation and related papers

Susan Somach
ssomach@gmail.com